

## Accountability of ICANN

The issue of how to ensure the legitimacy and accountability of ICANN is a concern, which finds voice in many of the proposals. Four broad stands can be gleaned from the submissions to NETmundial 14 on this issue. These are as following:

- I. Submissions which suggest that oversight over ICANN should end or endorse bottom-up oversight.
- II. Submissions which suggest that oversight of ICANN should be transferred to a multilateral or intergovernmental body.
- III. Submissions which suggest that oversight of ICANN should be transferred to another body not intergovernmental in nature.
- IV. Submissions which endorse multistakeholder governance of ICANN but are vague about the specifics of such governance model.

- I. Submissions which suggest that oversight over ICANN should end or endorse bottom-up oversight.

These submissions are of the opinion that ICANN should become an independent body with no oversight exercised by any other body on it. In other words, these proposals oppose the replacement of current US government oversight on ICANN, by oversight through any other body. In such a case, accountability of ICANN is sought to be ensured through strengthening multistakeholderism and reform *within* the ICANN structure.

The rationale behind such submissions is that giving additional stakeholders besides the NTIA a say in IANA function and ICANN oversight will only politicise ICANN and make it a subject of possible geopolitical power struggles by governments, ultimately ignoring the interests of internet users all over the world.

A list of these submissions is provided below.

Sl. No.	Proposal No.	Name of Proposal	Organisation	Sector	Region	Link
1	19	Roadmap for Globalising IANA: Four Principles and a Proposal for Reform	Internet Governance Project	Civil Society	North America	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/roadmap-for-globalizing-iana-four-principles-and-a-proposal-for-reform-a-submission-to-the-global-multistakeholder-meeting-on-the">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/roadmap-for-globalizing-iana-four-principles-and-a-proposal-for-reform-a-submission-to-the-global-multistakeholder-meeting-on-the</a>

						future-of-internet-governance/96
2	26	Roadmap for the Further Evolution of the Internet Governance Ecosystem- ICANN	Article 19 and Best Bits	Civil Society	Global	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/roadmap-for-the-further-evolution-of-the-internet-governance-ecosystem-icann/109">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/roadmap-for-the-further-evolution-of-the-internet-governance-ecosystem-icann/109</a>
3	36	Recommendations of the Forum on Internet Governance 2013 - Central Africa	Action de Sensibilisation sur les NTIC - ECOSOC - NGO	Civil Society	Democratic Republic of Congo	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/recommendations-of-the-forum-on-internet-governance-2013-central-africa/121">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/recommendations-of-the-forum-on-internet-governance-2013-central-africa/121</a>
4	42	Content Contribution to NetMundial on the Roadmap for the Further Evolution of the IG Ecosystem regarding the Internationalisation of the IANA Function	InternetNZ	Technical Community	New Zealand	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/content-contribution-to-netmundial-on-the-roadmap-for-the-further-evolution-of-the-ig-ecosystem-regarding-the-internationalisation-of-the-iana-function/130">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/content-contribution-to-netmundial-on-the-roadmap-for-the-further-evolution-of-the-ig-ecosystem-regarding-the-internationalisation-of-the-iana-function/130</a>
5	61	French	French Ministry of Foreign	Government	France	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/french-">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/french-</a>

		Government Submission to NETmundial	Affairs			government-submission-to-netmundial/154
6	101	Panel on Global Internet Cooperation and Governance Mechanisms: Contribution to NETmundial	Panel on Global Internet Cooperation and Governance Mechanisms	Other	Global	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/panel-on-global-internet-cooperation-and-governance-mechanisms-contribution-to-netmundial/204">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/panel-on-global-internet-cooperation-and-governance-mechanisms-contribution-to-netmundial/204</a>
7	122	Bottom-up Oversight in Multistakeholder Organisations	Avri Doria	Technical Community	USA	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/bottom-up-oversight-in-multistakeholder-organizations/237">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/bottom-up-oversight-in-multistakeholder-organizations/237</a>
8	162	APC Proposals for the Further Evolution of the Internet Governance Ecosystem	Association for Progressive Communications (APC)	Civil Society	APC is an international organisation with its executive director's office in South Africa	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/apc-proposals-for-the-further-evolution-of-the-internet-governance-ecosystem/280">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/apc-proposals-for-the-further-evolution-of-the-internet-governance-ecosystem/280</a>

II. Submissions which suggest that oversight of ICANN should be transferred to a multilateral or intergovernmental body

A second group of submissions argue that the oversight function of the ICANN should be transferred from the unilateral U.S. government (NTIA) oversight now, to oversight by all countries. This is suggested to counter the power imbalance exercised by one country over critical internet infrastructure, over others, by sharing oversight of ICANN with all others.

Some of such submissions envision such transfer of control by the US Government to an intergovernmental body like the ITU, others don't specify the details of the transfer, but merely mention that ICANN oversight should be multilateral in nature.

A list of such submissions is provided below.

Sl. No.	Proposal No.	Name of Proposal	Organisation	Sector	Region	Link
1	8	Roadmaps for Further Evolution of Internet Governance	Association for Proper Internet Governance	Civil Society	Switzerland	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/roadmaps-for-further-evolution-of-internet-governance/65">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/roadmaps-for-further-evolution-of-internet-governance/65</a>
2	119	Internet Governance Principles: Securing the Future of the Internet	CIPIT	Academia	Kenya, Africa	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/internet-governance-principles-securing-the-future-of-the-internet/233">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/internet-governance-principles-securing-the-future-of-the-internet/233</a>
3	121	Contribution from the Islamic Republic of Iran to the Global Multiskaeholder (sic) Meeting for the Future of the Internet, 23-24 April 2014 Sao Paulo, Brazil	Cyber Space National Center, Iran	Government	Islamic Republic of Iran	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/contribution-from-the-islamic-republic-of-iran-to-the-global-multiskaeholder-meeting-for-the-future-of-the-internet-23-24-april-2014-sao-paulo-brazil/236">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/contribution-from-the-islamic-republic-of-iran-to-the-global-multiskaeholder-meeting-for-the-future-of-the-internet-23-24-april-2014-sao-paulo-brazil/236</a>

4	125	Towards Reform of Global Internet Governance	The Society for Knowledge Commons	Civil Society	India and Brazil	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/towards-reform-of-global-internet-governance/240">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/towards-reform-of-global-internet-governance/240</a>
---	-----	--	-----------------------------------	---------------	------------------	---

III. Submissions which suggest that oversight of ICANN should be transferred to another body not intergovernmental in nature.

These submissions suggest the transfer of ICANN oversight to a non-intergovernmental or multilateral body. Such proposals also express their dissatisfaction with the unilateral US Government oversight of ICANN, but suggest replacing it with a non-multilateral body. Details of the composition of such bodies vary. Some call for replacement by a technical body, other envision a wholly newly created multistakeholder body, yet others call for signing of the ICANN AoC with US. Government, by a number of stakeholders, which will not include just governments. In many of these submissions, emphasis is also paid on the strengthening of GAC, while taking into consideration stakeholders other than governments.

A list of such submissions is provided below.

Sl.No.	Proposal No.	Name of Proposal	Organisation	Sector	Region	Link
1.	52	Europe, Austria, Fed. Ministry for Transport, Innovation and Technology	<a href="mailto:helga.mieling@bmvit.gv.at">helga.mieling@bmvit.gv.at</a>	Government	Austrian Federal Ministry for Transport, Innovation and Technology	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/europe-austria-fed-ministry-for-transport-innovation-and-technology/144">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/europe-austria-fed-ministry-for-transport-innovation-and-technology/144</a>
2.	63	Nominet Submission on Internet Governance Principles and the Roadmap	Nominet	Private Sector	UK	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/nominet-submission-on-internet-governance-principles-and-the-roadmap/156">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/nominet-submission-on-internet-governance-principles-and-the-roadmap/156</a>
3.	69	Democratising Global	Just Net Coalition	Civil Society	Global	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/</a>

		Governance of the Internet				ion/democratising-global-governance-of-the-internet/164
4.	94	Roadmap for the future development of the Internet Governance Ecosystem	Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Argentina	Government	Argentina	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/roadmap-for-the-future-development-of-the-internet-governance-ecosystem/196">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/roadmap-for-the-future-development-of-the-internet-governance-ecosystem/196</a>
5.	97	Orange Contribution for NETmundial	Orange Group	Private Sector	Deputy to the Chief Regulatory Officer Orange Group	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/orange/199">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/orange/199</a>
6.	140	DSCI Submission on Roadmap for Further Evolution of Internet Governance Ecosystem	Data Security Council of India	Private Sector	India	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/dsci-submission-on-roadmap-for-the-further-evolution-of-internet-governance-ecosystem/256">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/dsci-submission-on-roadmap-for-the-further-evolution-of-internet-governance-ecosystem/256</a>
7.	146	Evolution and Internationalisation of ICANN	CGI.br-Brazilian Internet Steering Committee	Other	Brazil	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/evolution-and-internationalization-of-icann/263">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/evolution-and-internationalization-of-icann/263</a>
8.	174	From Forum to NET-Nations	Nigeria Internet Registration Association	Technical Community	Nigeria	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/from-forum-to-net-nations/292">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/from-forum-to-net-nations/292</a>
9.	176	Addressing Three Prominent “How To” Questions	Luis Magalhes, Professor at IST of University	Academia	Portugal	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/addressing-three-prominent-how-to-questions-">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/addressing-three-prominent-how-to-questions-</a>

		on the Internet Governance Ecosystem Future	of Lisbon, Portugal; Panelist of ICANN's Strategy Panel on the Role in the Internet Governance System			on-the-internet-governance-ecosystem-future/294
10.	186	The Next Best Stage for the Future of Internet Governance is Democracy	Global Geneva	Civil Society	Geneva, Switzerland	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/the-next-best-stage-for-the-future-of-internet-governance-is-democracy/305">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/the-next-best-stage-for-the-future-of-internet-governance-is-democracy/305</a>

IV. Submissions which endorse globalisation and multistakeholder governance of ICANN but are vague about the specifics of such governance model

Lastly, there are submissions which call for the globalisation of ICANN and express their dissatisfaction with the U.S. Government oversight of it, while endorsing multistakeholder governance. However, these submissions are also vague about the details of such ICANN globalisation, and the structures in which it will be held accountable.

A list of such submissions is provided below.

Sl.No.	Proposal No.	Name of Proposal	Organisation	Sector	Region	Link
1.	46	Norwegian Contribution to the Sao Paulo Meeting	Norwegian government	Government	Norway, Europe	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/norwegian-government/137">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/norwegian-government/137</a>
2.	50	Contribution from the GSM Association to the Global Multistakeholder Meeting	GSMA	Private Sector	Global	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/contribution-from-the-gsm-association-to-the-global-multistakeholder-">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/contribution-from-the-gsm-association-to-the-global-multistakeholder-</a>

		on the Future of Internet Governance				meeting-on-the-future-of-internet-governance/141
3.	51	Contribution of Telefonica to NETmundial	Telefonica, S.A.	Private Sector	Spain	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/contribution-of-telefonica-to-netmundial/143">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/contribution-of-telefonica-to-netmundial/143</a>
4.	56	ETNO Contribution to NETmundial	ETNO [European Telecommunications Network Operators' Association]	Private Sector	Belgium	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/etno-contribution-to-netmundial/148">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/etno-contribution-to-netmundial/148</a>
5.	64	Submission by AHCINET to the Global Multistakeholder Meeting on the Future of Internet Governance. NETmundial	AHCINET	Private Sector	Latin America	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/submission-by-ahciet-to-the-global-multistakeholder-meeting-on-the-future-of-internet-governance-netmundial/157">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/submission-by-ahciet-to-the-global-multistakeholder-meeting-on-the-future-of-internet-governance-netmundial/157</a>
6.	70	Spanish Government Contribution to the Global Multi-stakeholder Meeting on the Future of Internet Governance	Ministry of Industry, Energy and Tourism, Spain	Government	Spain	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/multistakeholder-human-rights-stability-gac/165">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/multistakeholder-human-rights-stability-gac/165</a>
7.	80	Roadmap for the Further Evolution of the Internet Governance Ecosystem	European Commission	Government	Europe	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/roadmap-for-the-further-evolution-of-the-internet-governance-">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/roadmap-for-the-further-evolution-of-the-internet-governance-</a>

						ecosystem/177
8.	106	Submission on Internet Governance Principles and Roadmap for the Further Evolution of the Internet Governance Ecosystem	Kuwait Information Technology Society	Civil Society	Kuwait	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/kuwait-information-technology-society-kits-submission-on-internet-governance-principles-and-roadmap-for-the-further-evolution-of-the-internet-governance-ecosystem/214">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/kuwait-information-technology-society-kits-submission-on-internet-governance-principles-and-roadmap-for-the-further-evolution-of-the-internet-governance-ecosystem/214</a>
9.	111	Content Submission by the Federal Government of Mexico	Secretaria de Comunicaciones y Transportes, Mexico	Government	Mexico	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/content-submission-by-the-federal-government-of-mexico/219">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/content-submission-by-the-federal-government-of-mexico/219</a>
10.	114	Better Understanding and Cooperation for Internet Governance Principles and Its Roadmap	Japan Internet Service Providers Association	Private Sector	Japan	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/better-understanding-cooperation-for-internet-governance-principles-its-roadmap/222">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/better-understanding-cooperation-for-internet-governance-principles-its-roadmap/222</a>
11.	116	Deutsche Telekom's Contribution for to the Global Multistakeholder Meeting on the Future of Internet Governance	Deutsche Telekom AG	Private Sector	Germany /Europe	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/deutsche-telekom-s-contribution-for-to-the-global-multistakeholder-meeting-on-the-future-of-internet-governance/225">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/deutsche-telekom-s-contribution-for-to-the-global-multistakeholder-meeting-on-the-future-of-internet-governance/225</a>
12.	135	Joint	Group of	Civil	Latin	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/226">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/226</a>

		Contributions of Civil Society Organisations from Latin America to NetMundial	individuals and Civil Society Organizations from Latin America	Society	America	undial.br/contribution/joint-contributions-of-civil-society-organizations-from-latin-america-to-netmundial/251
13.	143	NRO Contribution to NETmundial	NRO (for AFRINIC, APNIC, ARIN, LACNIC, RIPE-NCC)	Technical Community	Mauritius	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/nro-contribution-to-netmundial/259">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/nro-contribution-to-netmundial/259</a>
14.	183	NETmundial Content Submission- endorsed by NIC Mexico	NIC Mexico	Technical Community	Mexico	<a href="http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/netmundial-content-submission-endorsed-by-nic-mexico/302">http://content.netmundial.br/contribution/netmundial-content-submission-endorsed-by-nic-mexico/302</a>